## BID COMPARISON
### Camden Avenue Improvements Phase 1
*Village of West Elkton, Preble County, Ohio*

**Bid Date: September 19, 2011 at 11:00 A.M.**

**Prepared: September 20, 2011**

**Engineer's Estimate: $239,000.00**

KRAMER & ASSOCIATES
Eaton, Ohio • Richmond, Indiana
Excellence in People, Service and Solutions
Phone (937) 456-1332 / Fax (937) 456-6912
www.kramer2000.com

| | | | | #1 | | #2 | | #3 | | #4 | | #5 | | #6 | | #7 | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | Rapier Electric, Inc. | | Byrco, Inc. | | W.G. Stang LLC | | C.G. Construction & Utilities, Inc. | | Prograde Excavation & Demolition LLC | | R.A. Miller Construction Comp. Inc. | | Brumbaugh Construction, Inc. | |
| ITEM | DESCRIPTION | QUANTITY | UNIT | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST |
| **ROADWAY** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 201 | Stumps Removed | 1 | EACH | $ 225.00 | $ 225.00 | $ 100.00 | $ 100.00 | $ 200.00 | $ 200.00 | $ 125.00 | $ 125.00 | $ 851.98 | $ 851.98 | $ 500.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 400.00 | $ 400.00 |
| 202 | Curb Removed | 525 | LF | $ 3.50 | $ 1,837.50 | $ 15.00 | $ 7,875.00 | $ 5.00 | $ 2,625.00 | $ 4.25 | $ 2,231.25 | $ 2.73 | $ 1,433.25 | $ 4.00 | $ 2,100.00 | $ 1.80 | $ 945.00 |
| 202 | Walk Removed | 496 | SY | $ 6.00 | $ 2,976.00 | $ 15.00 | $ 7,440.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 4,960.00 | $ 6.50 | $ 3,224.00 | $ 21.63 | $ 10,728.48 | $ 18.00 | $ 8,928.00 | $ 7.00 | $ 3,472.00 |
| 202 | Concrete Drives Removed | 26 | SY | $ 14.75 | $ 383.50 | $ 25.00 | $ 650.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 260.00 | $ 9.00 | $ 234.00 | $ 23.58 | $ 613.08 | $ 18.00 | $ 468.00 | $ 17.00 | $ 442.00 |
| 202 | Remove/Replace Wood Fence | 1 | LUMP | $ 2,200.00 | $ 2,200.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 964.92 | $ 964.92 | $ 875.00 | $ 875.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 750.00 |
| 202 | Storm Sewer Removed | 50 | LF | $ 11.25 | $ 562.50 | $ 18.00 | $ 900.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 15.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 19.98 | $ 999.00 | $ 5.00 | $ 250.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 500.00 |
| 203 | Rock Excavation | 25 | CY | $ 24.50 | $ 612.50 | $ 85.00 | $ 2,125.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 250.00 | $ 55.00 | $ 1,375.00 | $ 119.83 | $ 2,995.75 | $ 10.00 | $ 250.00 | $ 100.00 | $ 2,500.00 |
| 203 | Excavation | 216 | CY | $ 15.75 | $ 3,402.00 | $ 45.00 | $ 9,720.00 | $ 20.00 | $ 4,320.00 | $ 12.00 | $ 2,592.00 | $ 19.86 | $ 4,289.76 | $ 30.00 | $ 6,480.00 | $ 20.00 | $ 4,320.00 |
| 203 | Embankment | 201 | CY | $ 17.75 | $ 3,567.75 | $ 11.00 | $ 2,211.00 | $ 20.00 | $ 4,020.00 | $ 17.00 | $ 3,417.00 | $ 26.49 | $ 5,324.49 | $ 35.00 | $ 7,035.00 | $ 20.00 | $ 4,020.00 |
| 203 | Subgrade Compaction | 983 | SY | $ 2.50 | $ 2,457.50 | $ 8.00 | $ 7,864.00 | $ 2.00 | $ 1,966.00 | $ 1.50 | $ 1,474.50 | $ 1.98 | $ 1,946.34 | $ 1.00 | $ 983.00 | $ 3.00 | $ 2,949.00 |
| 253 | Pavement Repair | 20 | CY | $ 225.00 | $ 4,500.00 | $ 220.00 | $ 4,400.00 | $ 200.00 | $ 4,000.00 | $ 250.00 | $ 5,000.00 | $ 283.63 | $ 5,672.60 | $ 253.80 | $ 5,076.00 | $ 242.00 | $ 4,840.00 |
| 254 | Pavement Planing, Asphalt | 60 | SY | $ 38.00 | $ 2,280.00 | $ 16.50 | $ 990.00 | $ 15.00 | $ 900.00 | $ 38.00 | $ 2,280.00 | $ 38.52 | $ 2,311.20 | $ 37.80 | $ 2,268.00 | $ 38.00 | $ 2,280.00 |
| 301 | Bituminous Agg. Base | 20 | CY | $ 215.00 | $ 4,300.00 | $ 220.00 | $ 4,400.00 | $ 200.00 | $ 4,000.00 | $ 250.00 | $ 5,000.00 | $ 253.26 | $ 5,065.20 | $ 240.00 | $ 4,800.00 | $ 242.00 | $ 4,840.00 |
| 304 | Compacted Aggregate (Under Walk & Aprons) | 73 | CY | $ 50.00 | $ 3,650.00 | $ 45.00 | $ 3,285.00 | $ 40.00 | $ 2,920.00 | $ 46.00 | $ 3,358.00 | $ 34.94 | $ 2,550.62 | $ 115.00 | $ 8,395.00 | $ 67.00 | $ 4,891.00 |
| 304 | Compacted Aggregate (Under Curb & Widening) | 102 | CY | $ 50.00 | $ 5,100.00 | $ 45.00 | $ 4,590.00 | $ 40.00 | $ 4,080.00 | $ 46.00 | $ 4,692.00 | $ 35.01 | $ 3,571.02 | $ 92.50 | $ 9,435.00 | $ 67.00 | $ 6,834.00 |
| 304 | Compacted Aggregate Base (Subbase Failures) | 20 | CY | $ 50.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 55.00 | $ 1,100.00 | $ 40.00 | $ 800.00 | $ 33.00 | $ 660.00 | $ 36.91 | $ 738.20 | $ 100.00 | $ 2,000.00 | $ 42.00 | $ 840.00 |
| 304 | Gravel Drive Repair | 7 | CY | $ 55.00 | $ 385.00 | $ 55.00 | $ 385.00 | $ 40.00 | $ 280.00 | $ 46.00 | $ 322.00 | $ 34.94 | $ 244.58 | $ 50.00 | $ 350.00 | $ 67.00 | $ 469.00 |
| 407 | Tack Coat @ 0.075 gal/SY | 140 | GAL | $ 425.00 | $ 595.00 | $ 5.50 | $ 770.00 | $ 2.00 | $ 280.00 | $ 2.25 | $ 315.00 | $ 5.03 | $ 704.20 | $ 4.32 | $ 604.80 | $ 2.00 | $ 280.00 |
| 448 | Asphalt Scratch Course (1/2" Avg.) | 28 | CY | $ 174.00 | $ 4,872.00 | $ 176.00 | $ 4,928.00 | $ 175.00 | $ 4,900.00 | $ 156.00 | $ 4,368.00 | $ 163.03 | $ 4,564.84 | $ 175.00 | $ 4,900.00 | $ 150.00 | $ 4,200.00 |
| 448 | Asphalt Wedge Course (2" Avg.) | 60 | CY | $ 174.00 | $ 10,440.00 | $ 176.00 | $ 10,560.00 | $ 175.00 | $ 10,500.00 | $ 156.00 | $ 9,360.00 | $ 163.03 | $ 9,781.80 | $ 175.00 | $ 10,500.00 | $ 150.00 | $ 9,000.00 |
| 448 | Asphalt Concrete Intermed. Course | 92 | CY | $ 174.00 | $ 16,008.00 | $ 176.00 | $ 16,192.00 | $ 175.00 | $ 16,100.00 | $ 156.00 | $ 14,352.00 | $ 163.03 | $ 14,998.76 | $ 175.00 | $ 16,100.00 | $ 150.00 | $ 13,800.00 |
| 448 | Asphalt Concrete Surface Course | 79 | CY | $ 225.00 | $ 17,775.00 | $ 178.20 | $ 14,077.80 | $ 200.00 | $ 15,800.00 | $ 156.00 | $ 12,324.00 | $ 211.09 | $ 16,676.11 | $ 226.00 | $ 17,854.00 | $ 190.00 | $ 15,010.00 |
| 448 | Asphalt Drive Repair | 5 | CY | $ 265.00 | $ 1,325.00 | $ 210.00 | $ 1,050.00 | $ 200.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 156.00 | $ 780.00 | $ 252.31 | $ 1,261.55 | $ 270.00 | $ 1,350.00 | $ 150.00 | $ 750.00 |
| 452 | 6" Drive Apron | 10 | SY | $ 44.00 | $ 440.00 | $ 72.00 | $ 720.00 | $ 55.00 | $ 550.00 | $ 45.00 | $ 450.00 | $ 43.19 | $ 431.90 | $ 51.50 | $ 515.00 | $ 35.50 | $ 355.00 |
| 452 | 8" Drive Apron | 84 | SY | $ 51.00 | $ 4,284.00 | $ 81.00 | $ 6,804.00 | $ 60.00 | $ 5,040.00 | $ 52.00 | $ 4,368.00 | $ 45.75 | $ 3,843.00 | $ 51.50 | $ 4,326.00 | $ 30.00 | $ 2,520.00 |
| 452 | Concrete Drive Repair | 26 | SY | $ 51.00 | $ 1,326.00 | $ 72.00 | $ 1,872.00 | $ 60.00 | $ 1,560.00 | $ 52.00 | $ 1,352.00 | $ 42.45 | $ 1,103.70 | $ 51.50 | $ 1,339.00 | $ 35.50 | $ 923.00 |
| **603** | **12" HDPE Storm Pipe (Labor & Additional Material, No Pipe)** | **347** | **LF** | $ 24.75 | $ 8,588.25 | $ 20.00 | $ 6,940.00 | $ 26.00 | $ 9,022.00 | $ 28.00 | $ 9,716.00 | $ 29.21 | $ 10,135.87 | $ 58.00 | $ 20,126.00 | $ 34.00 | $ 11,798.00 |
| **603** | **15" HDPE Storm Pipe (Labor & Additional Material, No Pipe)** | **50** | **LF** | $ 25.25 | $ 1,262.50 | $ 20.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 30.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 32.00 | $ 1,600.00 | $ 35.21 | $ 1,760.50 | $ 71.00 | $ 3,550.00 | $ 44.00 | $ 2,200.00 |
| 603 | 4" Storm (Downspout Drain) Type E | 50 | LF | $ 6.00 | $ 300.00 | $ 9.00 | $ 450.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 6.00 | $ 300.00 | $ 9.08 | $ 454.00 | $ 20.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 500.00 |
| 604 | Inlet, Type Y | 4 | EA | $ 2,000.00 | $ 8,000.00 | $ 4,000.00 | $ 16,000.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 6,000.00 | $ 1,650.00 | $ 6,600.00 | $ 1,563.11 | $ 6,252.44 | $ 3,200.00 | $ 12,800.00 | $ 1,450.00 | $ 5,800.00 |
| 604 | Reconstruct Storm Inlet, as per plan | 1 | EA | $ 875.00 | $ 875.00 | $ 1,600.00 | $ 1,600.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 725.00 | $ 725.00 | $ 701.81 | $ 701.81 | $ 1,800.00 | $ 1,800.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 750.00 |
| 604 | Inlet, 2-2B | 1 | EA | $ 1,000.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 950.00 | $ 950.00 | $ 934.41 | $ 934.41 | $ 3,200.00 | $ 3,200.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 1,000.00 |
| 608 | 4' Concrete Walk (4" Mainline) | 4,286 | SF | $ 3.75 | $ 16,072.50 | $ 8.00 | $ 34,288.00 | $ 3.00 | $ 12,858.00 | $ 4.00 | $ 17,144.00 | $ 3.44 | $ 14,743.84 | $ 4.15 | $ 17,786.90 | $ 3.25 | $ 13,929.50 |
| 608 | 4' Concrete Walk (6" Residential Drive) | 76 | SF | $ 5.00 | $ 380.00 | $ 9.00 | $ 684.00 | $ 3.50 | $ 266.00 | $ 5.25 | $ 399.00 | $ 4.32 | $ 328.32 | $ 4.40 | $ 334.40 | $ 4.00 | $ 304.00 |
| 608 | 4' Concrete Walk (8" Commercial Drive) | 456 | SF | $ 5.75 | $ 2,622.00 | $ 10.00 | $ 4,560.00 | $ 4.00 | $ 1,824.00 | $ 6.00 | $ 2,736.00 | $ 5.09 | $ 2,321.04 | $ 4.75 | $ 2,166.00 | $ 4.50 | $ 2,052.00 |
| 608 | Concrete Bridge Walk Slab, as per plan | 208 | SF | $ 15.25 | $ 3,172.00 | $ 8.00 | $ 1,664.00 | $ 15.00 | $ 3,120.00 | $ 16.00 | $ 3,328.00 | $ 40.99 | $ 8,525.92 | $ 14.50 | $ 3,016.00 | $ 10.50 | $ 2,184.00 |
| 608 | Curb Ramp | 3 | EA | $ 325.00 | $ 975.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 350.00 | $ 1,050.00 | $ 350.00 | $ 1,050.00 | $ 265.68 | $ 797.04 | $ 500.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 415.00 | $ 1,245.00 |
| 609 | Curb & Gutter | 1,025 | LF | $ 11.75 | $ 12,043.75 | $ 11.50 | $ 11,787.50 | $ 15.00 | $ 15,375.00 | $ 12.00 | $ 12,300.00 | $ 12.75 | $ 13,068.75 | $ 20.00 | $ 20,500.00 | $ 11.00 | $ 11,275.00 |
| 614 | Maintenance of Traffic | 1 | LUMP | $ 15,000.00 | $ 15,000.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 10,000.00 | $ 10,000.00 | $ 5,500.00 | $ 5,500.00 | $ 5,368.22 | $ 5,368.22 | $ 5,000.00 | $ 5,000.00 | $ 4,300.00 | $ 4,300.00 |
| 638 | Relocate/Adjust Cleanout to Grade | 2 | EA | $ 250.00 | $ 500.00 | $ 800.00 | $ 1,600.00 | $ 300.00 | $ 600.00 | $ 175.00 | $ 350.00 | $ 181.01 | $ 362.02 | $ 500.00 | $ 1,000.00 | $ 305.00 | $ 610.00 |
| 638 | Adjust Manhole to Grade | 1 | EA | $ 400.00 | $ 400.00 | $ 800.00 | $ 800.00 | $ 300.00 | $ 300.00 | $ 550.00 | $ 550.00 | $ 410.37 | $ 410.37 | $ 1,200.00 | $ 1,200.00 | $ 200.00 | $ 200.00 |
| 640 | Pavement Marking | 1 | LUMP | $ 1,800.00 | $ 1,800.00 | $ 900.00 | $ 900.00 | $ 1,850.00 | $ 1,850.00 | $ 1,800.00 | $ 1,800.00 | $ 2,033.13 | $ 2,033.13 | $ 1,900.00 | $ 1,900.00 | $ 1,900.00 | $ 1,900.00 |
| 653 | Topsoil Furnished and Placed | 101 | CY | $ 45.50 | $ 4,595.50 | $ 30.00 | $ 3,030.00 | $ 30.00 | $ 3,030.00 | $ 37.00 | $ 3,737.00 | $ 38.97 | $ 3,935.97 | $ 40.00 | $ 4,040.00 | $ 35.00 | $ 3,535.00 |
| 654 | Precast Reinforced Concrete Outlet | 2 | EA | $ 1,075.00 | $ 2,150.00 | $ 2,500.00 | $ 5,000.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 750.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 843.63 | $ 1,687.26 | $ 800.00 | $ 1,600.00 | $ 661.00 | $ 1,322.00 |
| 659 | Seed & Mulch | 891 | SY | $ 1.50 | $ 1,336.50 | $ 10.00 | $ 8,910.00 | $ 2.00 | $ 1,782.00 | $ 1.50 | $ 1,336.50 | $ 3.58 | $ 3,189.78 | $ 4.50 | $ 4,009.50 | $ 2.50 | $ 2,227.50 |
| Spec | Audio/Video Recording of Construction Corridor | 1 | LUMP | $ 1,300.00 | $ 1,300.00 | $ 800.00 | $ 800.00 | $ 1,200.00 | $ 1,200.00 | $ 925.00 | $ 925.00 | $ 363.41 | $ 363.41 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 1,500.00 | $ 550.00 | $ 550.00 |
| | **Total Subtotal** | | | | **$ 178,877.25** | | **$ 221,522.30** | | **$ 166,338.00** | | **$ 157,450.25** | | **$ 181,040.43** | | **$ 225,710.60** | | **$ 159,812.00** |
| | **Amount as Bid** | | | | **$ 178,877.25** | | **$ 221,522.30** | | **$ 166,338.00** | | **$ 157,450.25** | | **$ 181,040.43** | | **$ 225,710.60** | | **$ 159,812.00** |
| | **Difference** | | | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** |

## MBE Supplier

| ITEM | DESCRIPTION | QUANTITY | UNIT | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST | UNIT COST | TOTAL COST |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| ***ITEMS FOR UNIT PRICE BID (Pipe Only)*** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| **603** | **12" HDPE Storm Pipe (Pipe Only)** | **347** | **LF** | $ 6.00 | $ 2,082.00 | $ 7.00 | $ 2,429.00 | $ 6.00 | $ 2,082.00 | $ - | $ - | $ 5.94 | $ 2,061.18 | $ 7.00 | $ 2,429.00 | $ - | $ - |
| **603** | **15" HDPE Storm Pipe (Pipe Only)** | **50** | **LF** | $ 7.80 | $ 390.00 | $ 9.00 | $ 450.00 | $ 8.00 | $ 400.00 | $ - | $ - | $ 8.82 | $ 441.00 | $ 9.00 | $ 450.00 | $ - | $ - |
| | **Total Subtotal** | | | | **$ 2,472.00** | | **$ 2,879.00** | | **$ 2,482.00** | | **$ -** | | **$ 2,502.18** | | **$ 2,879.00** | | **$ -** |
| | **Amount as Bid** | | | | **$ 2,472.50** | | **$ 2,879.00** | | **$ 2,482.00** | | **$ -** | | **$ 2,502.18** | | **$ 2,879.00** | | **$ -** |
| | **Difference** | | | | **$ (0.50)** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** | | **$ -** |